

The Protection of Fundamental Rights in the Legal Order of the European Union

With Emphasis on the
Institutional Protection of those Rights



Manfred A. Daus



PETER LANG Internationaler Verlag der Wissenschaften

Contents

List of abbreviations	15
1. Introduction: The importance of international fundamental rights in today's world	17
2. The historic deficit of comprehensive guarantees of fundamental rights in the written Community/Union Law	19
2.1. The historic lacunas in the "lex scripta" on fundamental rights	19
2.2. The requirement of a comprehensive praetorian protection of fundamental rights	23
3. Dogmatic foundations of the fundamental rights' case-law of the ECJ	25
3.1. The emergence of fundamental rights' case-law of the ECJ	25
3.2. Sources of law in the light of fundamental rights' case-law of the ECJ	27
3.2.1. Primary sources of law: the general principles of the Community law	28
3.2.2. Secondary sources of law: Member States' constitutional traditions and European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) .	30
3.2.2.1. Preliminary remark	30
3.2.2.2. Member States' constitutional traditions	31
3.2.2.3. European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)	34
3.2.2.4. Excursus: the tense relationship between the Community/Union law and the national law in the area of fundamental rights	37

3.3. Definition and classification of fundamental rights in the light of the case-law of the ECJ	41
3.3.1. Fundamental rights and freedoms	41
3.3.2. Institutional guarantee vs. subjective individual right	42
3.3.3. Enforceable right vs. programme provisions (soft-law)	43
3.3.4. Rights of defence vs. rights to participate	43
3.3.5. Equality rights	44
3.4. Commitment to fundamental rights and entitlement to fundamental rights	45
3.4.1. Commitment to fundamental rights	45
3.4.2. Entitlement to fundamental rights	47
3.5. Restrictions on fundamental rights and limits of restrictions on fundamental rights	49
3.5.1. Preliminary remark	49
3.5.2. Restrictions on fundamental rights	50
3.5.3. Limits of restrictions on fundamental rights	51
3.5.3.1. Limits of restrictions on proportionality	52
3.5.3.2. Limits of restrictions on the guarantee of the substance (essential content)	53
3.6. Individual fundamental rights recognised by the case-law of the ECJ	54
3.6.1. Human dignity	54
3.6.2. Right to property	55
3.6.3. Freedom to pursue economic activities	57
3.6.4. Freedom of expression and religion	58
3.6.5. Respect for private and family life	59
3.6.6. Principle of equality	60
3.6.7. Principle of proportionality	62
3.6.8. Basic procedural rights	63
3.6.8.1. Legal certainty	64
3.6.8.2. Protection of legitimate expectations	65
3.6.8.3. Right to a hearing	66
3.6.8.4. Right against self-incrimination	67
3.6.8.5. The <i>ne bis in idem</i> principle	68
4. From the case-law of the ECJ to the European Charter of Fundamental Rights	69
4.1. Process of emergence of the Charter of Fundamental Rights	69
4.2. Legal nature of the Charter of Fundamental Rights prior to the Lisbon Treaty	70

4.3. Contents of the Charter of Fundamental Rights	72
4.3.1. Preliminary remark and overview	72
4.3.2. Human dignity	76
4.3.3. Freedoms	78
4.3.4. Equality	83
4.3.5. Solidarity	85
4.3.6. Citizens' rights	90
4.3.7. Justice	92
4.3.8. General provisions	94
4.3.8.1. Scope of the Charter of Fundamental Rights	94
4.3.8.2. Scope of guaranteed rights	97
4.3.8.3. Level of protection	99
4.3.8.4. Prohibition of abuse of rights	99
4.4. Summary appraisal of the Charter of Fundamental Rights	100
5. On the path to a legally binding catalogue of fundamental rights	103
5.1. Preliminary remark	103
5.2. Arguments in favour of a legally-binding force of the Charter of Fundamental Rights	105
5.3. Modalities for vesting the Charter of Fundamental Rights with legally-binding force	107
5.4. Arguments in favour of an accession of the Union to the ECHR	109
5.5. Modalities for an accession of the Union to the ECHR	111
6. Institutional protection of fundamental rights	113
6.1. Basic principles of the system of legal protection in the Community/Union	113
6.1.1 The European Community as a Community based on law	113
6.1.2. Dualistic structure of Community/Union jurisdiction	115
6.1.3. Roles and responsibilities of the institutional Union courts ...	116
6.1.4. Procedural law	118
6.1.4.1. Litigious procedure	118
6.1.4.1.1. Treaty infringement procedure	118
6.1.4.1.1.1. Presentation of the case	118
6.1.4.1.1.2. Assessment of the case with regard to the protection of fundamental rights	121

6.1.4.1.2. Actions for annulment and for failure to act	122
6.1.4.1.2.1. Presentation of the cases (Generalities)	122
6.1.4.1.2.2. Specificities of the action for annulment	123
6.1.4.1.2.3. Specificities of the action for failure to act	129
6.1.4.1.2.4. Assessment of the cases with regard to the protection of fundamental rights	131
6.1.4.1.3. Union actions for damages	132
6.1.4.1.3.1. Presentation of the cases (Generalities)	132
6.1.4.1.3.2. Specificities of the action for liability of the Union	133
6.1.4.1.3.3. Specificities of the action for State liability	135
6.1.4.1.3.4. Assessment of the cases with regard to the protection of fundamental rights	137
6.1.4.2. Preliminary ruling procedure	139
6.1.4.2.1. Presentation of the case (Generalities)	139
6.1.4.2.2. The concept of national courts	141
6.1.4.2.3. Right to refer and obligation to refer	141
6.1.4.2.4. Issues eligible for referral	144
6.1.4.2.5. Assessment of the case with regard to the protection of fundamental rights	145
6.1.5. Ways to improve the institutional protection of fundamental rights	146
6.1.5.1. Preliminary remark	146
6.1.5.2. Procedures, which are not suitable for an autonomous protection of fundamental rights	147
6.1.5.2.1. Union actions for damages	147
6.1.5.2.2. Preliminary ruling procedure	148

6.1.5.3. Procedures, which could, in a modified form, be suitable for an autonomous protection of fundamental rights	148
6.1.5.3.1. Treaty infringement procedure	148
6.1.5.3.2. Actions for annulment and for failure to act	149
6.1.5.4. Summary appraisal of the “suitability” of the existing types of procedures for the protection of fundamental rights before the institutional Union courts	151
6.1.5.5. Introduction of a special fundamental rights complaint	152
6.1.5.5.1. Preliminary remark	152
6.1.5.5.2. Subject-matter of an action	152
6.1.5.5.3. Right to bring an action	153
6.1.5.5.4. Scope of protection	153
6.1.5.5.5. Subsidiarity	154
6.1.5.5.6. Substantive jurisdiction of the ECJ	157
6.1.5.5.7. Legal effects of a judgement to be granted	157
7. Conclusion	159
Bibliography	163