



Yuanyuan Wang

The Independence of Judges in China and Germany



PETER LANG

Contents

Introduction	13
I. Why China?	13
II. Why the Independence of Judges?	15
III. Why Germany?	17
1. Tradition	18
2. The Qualifications of Judges	19
3. The Selection and Appointment of Judges	20
4. The Status of Judges	21
IV. Purpose, Methodology and Main Conclusions	22
Part I Basic Principles	30
Chapter I Principles of the Independence of Judges	30
Section I Necessity for the Independence of Judges	30
(1) The Principle of the Independence of Judges and the Separation of Powers	31
(2) The Independence of Judges and the Principle of the State under the Rule of Law	32
Section II Material Aspects of the Independence of Judges	34
(1) Substantive Independence	34
(2) Independence of status	38
Chapter II Historical Aspects of the Independence of Judges	42
Section I Development	42
(1) The Feudal Period	42
(2) Modern Times	44
(3) From the Founding of New China to the Cultural Revolution	47
(4) After the Third Plenum of the 11 th Central Committee of the CCP	50
Section II Historical Development of the Independence of Judges in Germany	54
Section III Comparison	55
(1) The Transplantation of Laws and Legal Education	55
(2) Establishment of the Idea of the Rule of Law	57
Chapter III The Court System and the Independence of Judges	59
Section I The Situation in Chinese Courts	59
(1) The Relationship between Courts and Legislative Authorities	59
(2) The Relationship Between the Courts and Executive Authorities	62
Section II Establishment and Authority of Chinese Courts	63
(1) The Organisation and Authority of the Local People's Courts at various levels	65
(a) Basic People's Courts	65
(b) Intermediate People's Courts	66
(c) Higher People's Courts	67
(2) Organisation and Authority of the Special People's Courts	69
(a) Military Courts	69
(b) Maritime Courts	71

(c) Railway Transport Courts.....	72
(3) Organisation and Authority of the Supreme People's Court	75
(a) Supervising the adjudication of the local People's Courts at various levels and special People's Courts.....	75
(b) Handling three kinds of cases which it adjudicates:	75
(c) Examining and approving death sentences.....	76
(d) Judicial Interpretation	78
Section III Judicial Organisation of Chinese Courts	79
(1) Single-judge Bench	79
(2) Collegial Panel	79
(3) Judicial Committee	81
(a) Discussing important or difficult cases	81
(b) Summarising judicial experience.....	82
(c) Discussing other issues relating to adjudication.....	82
Section IV Basic System of Adjudicative Work.....	83
(1) Public Trial System	83
(2) System in which the Second Instance is the Final Instance	84
(3) System of Judicial Review of Death Sentences	86
(4) System of Trial Supervision.....	87
(a) Brief Introduction	87
(b) Rehearing or Retrial Lodged by a People's Court	87
(c) Rehearing or Retrial Lodged by the People's Procuratorate	88
(d) Rehearing or Retrial Lodged by a Party.....	88
(e) Trial Procedure of Rehearing Cases	89
Section V Comparing the Court Systems	89
(1) German Federal Court System	89
(2) Comparing the Court Systems of China and Germany.....	92
(a) The Position of the Courts within the Organisation of the State.....	92
(b) The Configuration of Courts	93
(c) Forms of Adjudicative Organisation	94
Part 2 Elements of the Independence of Judges	97
A Substantive Independence.....	97
(A) Independence from the Executive.....	97
Chapter 1 Selection of Judges.....	97
Section I Selection Criteria for Judges in China	98
(1) Posts and Grades of Judges	98
(2) Conditions for Judges in China	101
(a) History	101
(b) Provisions of Laws Currently in Effect.....	103
Section II Conditions for Judges in Germany	110
(1) Types of German Judge	110
(a) Judges Appointed for Life (Richter auf Lebenszeit).....	110
(b) Judges Appointed for a Fixed Term (Richter auf Zeit).....	110

(c) Probationary Judges (Richter auf Probe).....	111
(d) Judges on Commission (Richter kraft Auftrags).....	111
(2) Conditions for German Judges.....	112
(a) University Education in Law.....	112
(b) The First State Examination.....	113
(c) Preparatory Service	114
(d) The Second State Examination	115
Section III Comparison.....	116
(1) Age Requirements.....	116
(2) Educational Requirements	117
(3) Requirements for the Judicial Examination	117
(4) Health Requirements.....	118
(5) Practical Experience Requirements.....	119
(6) Miscellaneous.....	120
(a) Different Levels of Court	120
(b) Differences Between Areas.....	121
Section IV Process of Judicial Selection in China.....	122
(1) Civil Service Examination and Recruitment of Candidate Judges	122
(2) Procedures for Judicial Selection.....	124
(a) Statutory Principal Organs and Procedures.....	124
(b) Principal Organs and Procedures in Practice	126
Section V Process of Judicial Selection in Germany.....	129
(1) Judges of the Constitutional Courts	130
(a) Judges of the Federal Constitutional Court	130
(b) Judges of Land Constitutional Courts	131
(2) Federal Judges.....	132
(a) The Federal Court of Justice	132
(b) Other Federal Courts	133
(3) <i>Land</i> Judges.....	135
Section VI Comparison.....	139
Chapter II Service Supervision (<i>Dienstaufsicht</i>) of Judges	141
Section I The Service Supervision of Judges in China	143
(1) External Supervision	143
(a) Legally Binding Supervision.....	143
(b) Non-Legally Binding Supervision	150
(2) Internal Supervision	154
(a) The System of Examination and Appraisal of Judges.....	154
(b) The System of Disciplining Judges.....	159
(c) The Influence of Internal Supervision on the Independence of Judges.....	171
Section II The Service Supervision of Judges in Germany.....	174
(1) The Scope and Limitation of the Service Supervision.....	174
(a) The Federal Constitutional Court.....	175
(b) Law Courts.....	175

(c) Administrative Courts	175
(d) Labour Courts	176
(e) Social Courts	176
(f) Finance Courts	176
(2) The Manner of Service Supervision.....	177
(a) Observation (Beobachtung).....	177
(b) Correction (Berichtigung).....	178
(3) Service Courts	179
(4) The System of Appraisal of Judges.....	180
(a) The Character and Purpose of Appraisal.....	180
(b) The Organs of Appraisal	181
(c) The Content of Appraisal	182
(d) The Result of Appraisal	182
(5) The System of Discipline	182
(a) Disciplinary Organs.....	183
(b) Grounds for Disciplinary Measures	183
(c) Disciplinary Measures	188
(d) Disciplinary Procedure.....	191
(6) The System of Impeachment.....	193
(a) The Organs of Impeachment	193
(b) The Grounds for Impeachment	194
(c) The Punishment of Impeachment.....	194
(d) The Procedure of the Impeachment Trial.....	195
(e) Relief Measures.....	196
(f) The Relationship Between Crime and Impeachment and Between Discipline and Impeachment	196
(7) Summary	197
Section III Comparison.....	198
(1) The System of Appraisal.....	198
(2) The Disciplinary System.....	199
(a) Legal Provisions.....	199
(b) Organs of Discipline	199
(c) Subjects of Disciplinary Measures	200
(d) The Grounds for Discipline.....	200
(e) The Disciplinary Measures.....	200
(3) The System of Impeachment.....	201
(4) Other aspects	201
(B) Independence from the Legislature.....	202
Chapter III The Independence of Judges from the Legislature.....	202
Section I Formal and Informal Influence of the Legislature	204
Section II Means of Balancing the Legislature – Judges’ Power of Judicial Review ..	206
Section III The Luoyang Seed Case and Judges’ Power of Judicial Review in China	213
(1) Main Points of the Case	214

(2) Issues	215
(3) Reflection and Comparison with Judicial Review by Judges in Germany	218
(a) Courts' Limited Powers of Judicial Review	218
(b) Comparison with Germany	219
(c) The Abuse of Judicial Review in China	220
(d) Proposals for Improvement	221
(C) Independence within the Judicial branch	222
Chapter IV The Administration and Organisation of Courts	222
Section I The Provision of Goods and Materials to the Courts	224
Section II The Autonomy of Courts	228
Section III Prohibiting Extraordinary Courts (<i>Ausnahmegerichte</i>), Ad-Hoc Courts (<i>Ad-Hoc-Gerichte</i>) and Special Courts (<i>Sondergerichte</i>)	230
Section IV Hierarchical Dependence (<i>hierarchische Abhängigkeit</i>)	232
(1) Control by the Judicial Instances (<i>instanzgerichtliche Urteilskontrolle</i>)	232
(2) The Internal Dependence of Courts	234
Section V Manipulation in the Distribution of Work	237
(1) German Protection of the Principle of Statutory Judges	239
(2) The Chinese Practice of Distributing Work	241
Section VI Conclusions	243
(1) Comparison	243
(2) Opinions on Reform	245
(a) Funding	245
(b) Reform of the Internal Organisation of Courts	246
B Independence of status	248
Chapter V Guaranteeing the Status of Judges	248
Section I The German System of Guaranteeing the Status of Judges	249
(1) A Summary of Guaranteeing the Status of Judges	249
(a) Preconditions	249
(b) The Ban in Principle on Dismissal, Suspension, Transfer and Retirement	250
(c) Exceptions	251
(2) Dismissal	251
(a) <i>Ipsa Iure</i> Dismissal	252
(b) Appropriate Dismissal (<i>Entlassung durch Verfügung</i>)	254
(c) Procedure for Dismissal	256
(d) Effect of Dismissal	257
(3) <i>Ipsa Iure</i> Termination of Employment as Judge	259
(a) Termination by Court Decision	259
(b) Termination due to Election to the Bundestag or a Land Legislative Body	260
(4) Relocation (<i>Versetzung</i>) and Suspension (<i>Amtsenthbung</i>) of Judges	261
(a) The Concept of Relocation and Suspension	261
(b) The Subject of Relocation and Suspension (Paragraph 1 of Article 30 of the German Judges Act)	262
(c) The Procedure of Relocation and Suspension	264

(5) Retirement	265
(a) Types of Retirement and Grounds for Retirement	265
(b) Procedure for Retirement	267
(c) Benefits to Retired Judges	269
(6) Secondment (<i>Abordnung</i>)	269
(a) The Meaning of Secondment	269
(b) Procedure and Consequences of Secondment	270
(c) Secondment under Special Circumstances	271
(7) Effects of the Independence of Status on Court Organisation	271
(8) The Independence and Promotion (<i>Beförderung</i>) of Judges	272
(9) Salaries	273
(a) Summary	273
(b) The Opinions of the Federal Constitutional Court	273
(c) Latest Developments in Judges' Salaries in Germany	274
Section II The System of Guaranteeing the Status of Judges in China	275
(1) Removal	276
(a) Grounds for Removal	276
(b) The Procedure of Removal	283
(2) Demotion from a Post	283
(a) Grounds for Demotion from a Post	283
(b) The Procedure of Demotion from a Post	285
(3) Dismissal	285
(4) Disciplinary measures	286
(5) Judicial Independence and the Retirement of Judges	286
(a) Types of Retirement and Grounds for Retirement	286
(b) The Procedure of Retirement	290
(c) Retirement Benefits	290
(6) Guarantee of the Status of Judges and Their Wages and Benefits	291
Section III Comparison	292
C Internal Independence	300
Chapter VI The Internal Independence of Judges	300
Section I Social Influences	304
Section II Influence of the Party	310
Section III Brief Summary	316
Outlook	318
Bibliography	321
Reports / Documents / Interviews	337